

MINUTES

CITY OF CARSON REGULAR MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CARSON CITY HALL

701 East Carson Street, Second Floor
Carson, CA 90745

January 24, 2012 – 6:30 P.M.

1. **CALL TO ORDER** Vice-Chairman Gordon called the meeting to order at 6:37 P.M.
2. **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE** Commissioner Schaefer led the Salute to the Flag.
3. **ROLL CALL**

Planning Commissioners Present: Diaz, Goolsby, Gordon, Schaefer, Saenz, Verrett

Planning Commissioners Absent: Brimmer; Faletogo, (excused); Williams, (excused)

Planning Commissioners Departed Early: None

Planning Staff Present: Senior Planner Signo, City Attorney Wynder, Assistant City Attorney Tabian, Associate Planner Newberg, Recording Secretary Bothe
4. **AGENDA POSTING CERTIFICATION** Recording Secretary Bothe indicated that all posting requirements had been met.
5. **AGENDA APPROVAL** Commissioner Saenz moved, seconded by Commissioner Diaz, to approve the Agenda as submitted. Motion carried, 6-0 (absent Commissioners Brimmer, Faletogo, Williams).
6. **INSTRUCTIONS TO WITNESSES** Vice-Chairman Gordon requested that all persons wishing to provide testimony stand for the oath, complete the general information card at the podium, and submit it to the secretary for recordation.
7. **SWEARING OF WITNESSES** Assistant City Attorney Tabian
8. **ORAL COMMUNICATIONS** For items **NOT** on the agenda. Speakers are limited to three minutes. None.

9.	CONSENT CALENDAR	None
-----------	-------------------------	------

10.	CONTINUED PUBLIC HEARING	None
------------	---------------------------------	------

11. PUBLIC HEARING

A) Design Overlay Review No. 1455-11 (corrected number is "1445-11")

Applicant's Request:

The applicant, Ruben Gutierrez, is requesting to build a new 1,393-square-foot single-story, single-family residence with an attached two-car garage on a 40-foot by 105-foot lot. The subject property is located at 20832 Shearer Avenue.

Staff Report and Recommendation:

Senior Planner Signo presented staff report and the recommendation to WAIVE further reading and ADOPT Resolution No. 12-2421, entitled, "A Resolution of the Planning Commission of the city of Carson approving Design Overlay Review No. 1455-11 for construction of a new single-family residence located at 20832 Shearer Avenue." Senior Planner Signo corrected the case number, stating that it should be Design Overlay Review No. 1445-11, not 1455-11.

Vice-Chairman Gordon opened the public hearing.

Ruben Gutierrez, applicant, noted his concurrence with the conditions of approval.

Vice-Chairman Gordon closed the public hearing.

Planning Commission Decision:

Commissioner Diaz moved, seconded by Commissioner Saenz, to concur with staff recommendation, thus adopting Resolution No. 12-2421. Motion carried, 6-0 (absent Commissioners Brimmer, Faletogo, Williams).

11. PUBLIC HEARING

B) Design Overlay Review No. 1436-11

Applicant's Request:

The applicant, Trammel Crow Company, is requesting to construct a 230,000-square-foot, multi-tenant industrial building on a currently vacant and unimproved 12-acre site known as the former "Evergreen" site, located in the ML-D (Manufacturing, Light – Design Overlay) zoned district. The subject site is located at 16325 South Avalon Boulevard.

Staff Report and Recommendation:

Associate Planner Newberg presented staff report and the recommendation to ADOPT the Negative Declaration; APPROVE Design Overlay Review No. 1436-11; and WAIVE further reading and ADOPT Resolution No. 12-2422, entitled, "A Resolution of the Planning Commission of the city of Carson approving Design Overlay Review No. 1436-11 for the construction of a 230,000-square-foot multi-tenant warehouse and distribution building, as well as associated landscaping, signs, walls and fencing improvements on

the subject site located at 16325 South Avalon Boulevard.” He highlighted the following modifications to the conditions of approval:

- Replace Condition No. 24 with the following: An aesthetic combination of height, color and fenestration shall be incorporated into all building facades, subject to Planning Division approval;
- Amend the last sentence of Condition No. 28 as follows: The design of such wall is subject to review and approval of the Planning Division and required to be installed prior to the issuance of a certificate of occupancy for the new warehouse building;
- Amend Condition No. 48 by striking the word “are” and replacing it with “may be”;
- Amend the last sentence of Condition No. 66 as follows: The maximum driveway approach width allowed along the site’s Avalon and Gardena Boulevard frontages is 40 feet;
- Add the following to the end of Condition No. 67 as follows: Notwithstanding this condition, the developer shall not be required to provide underground utility lines in connection with any sidewalk repairs, and/or any driveway repairs, modifications, or construction, which may be required pursuant to Condition Nos. 62-66 above; and
- Amend Condition No. 77 as follows: The applicant shall submit for any necessary lot line adjustment or lot merger application, as required by the Engineering and/or Building and Safety Divisions, prior to the issuance of a building permit.

Commissioner Schaefer asked how long and tall the buffer is between this property and the mobilehome park.

Associate Planner Newberg explained there is a grassed area buffer between the two properties and a depressed area to catch water that drains from the site, according to the SUSMP program; advised that this catch area does two things: provides for adequate retention of the water from storm runoff and also provides a buffer between this property and the mobilehome park; and he advised that there is also an 8-foot high wall.

Commissioner Schaefer asked for input on what mitigation is being suggested for noise impacts to the mobilehome park residents.

Associate Planner Newberg advised that all the impacts have been thoroughly addressed and mitigated through the conditions of approval and/or are managed through the City’s municipal code standards; and stated that the issue regarding noise impacts to the residents had been given serious consideration, noting that staff believes the noise issue has been appropriately addressed. He added there is adequate distance between the residents and this building/site layout; and he mentioned that the mobilehome park is a nonconforming use and will soon be closed.

Commissioner Schaefer asked what recourse the residents will have if these operations become a nuisance.

Associate Planner Newberg stated that the residents should contact the city to determine if they are found to be in violation of codes.

Commissioner Schaefer expressed her concern for the residents, pointing out that this is a manufacturing area and that the codes apply to manufacturing operations.

Associate Planner Newberg stated that if the Commission wants to add an additional condition, they can do it this evening; and he pointed out that it is not known yet who the tenants will be or what their hours of operation will be. He added that this mobilehome park is near term abatement, November 2012; and that if the Commission wants to add an extra condition, it could state that the extra condition would no longer be applicable following the November 2012 closure date. He added that staff has not received any application for extending the nonconforming use of this mobilehome park.

Commissioner Goolsby stated that since the park will be closing soon, he does not believe it is necessary to add any additional conditions.

Chairman Faleto go opened the public hearing.

Jason Gremillion, representing Trammell Crow Company, stated that they are a commercial-residential developer that has been in business for 64 years, 32 years in California; he reminded the Planning Commission that they provided the Planning Commission a presentation of this proposal in September 2011; and he expressed his belief they have developed a project that preserves the environment and is applying their planning design to the highest and best use. He stated this sustainable development will create value to the area, increasing long-term returns by decreasing life cycle costs; and that it will improve the quality of life in the nearby neighborhoods. He provided some background information on this under-utilized site.

Mr. Gremillion stated there will be increased dock ratio, one per every 9,000 square feet; that the building has been modified for rear loading for multi-tenant capacity; that they have greatly enhanced the exterior design to be more consistent with offices; that they have established ingress/egress routes for trucks, with a counterclockwise circulation; explained that as drivers come in, there is more maneuverability by backing up into the dock base; and stated that through this dedicated ingress/egress, it is a safer transition from Avalon Boulevard. He explained that a truck driver is more comfortable with transitioning into the side along the north and having access out to the side along a much deeper view where they can more adequately assess the distance coming out. He advised that they have widened the throat of the truck entrance; that they have removed all marking along the north entrance by 430 feet by 60 feet with unobstructed access capable of holding 7 full-length truck-trailer combinations in that designated throat; that they have provided a curved entry which allows trucks to more easily transition into the loading area; and that they have created landscaped buffers throughout the site to protect pedestrian and automobile traffic. He stated they have also added an 80-foot variable detention buffer; that they will install low level lighting throughout the site; and he happily announced that this project is two points away from being gold certified under the LEED program, noting they are pursuing LEED silver and may potentially pursue LEED gold. He added that an 8-foot high CMU wall will go along the property line to further minimize noise and light transference. He mentioned that the buildings will be for sale or lease.

Commissioner Saenz asked if union labor will be used for the project.

Mr. Gremillion stated that they use the same contractor on all their projects, some who are union labor.

Commissioner Goolsby complimented the applicant on the project design.

Donna Spenser, representing the owner of Rancho Dominguez Mobile Estates, stated that they submitted a letter addressing their concerns with this project, highlighting their concerns for adequate drainage, noise restrictions, and restrictions on operating hours of the traffic coming in and out of this facility. She explained that these properties have a history of drainage problems and that she wants to make sure construction activities will not create drainage problems.

Associate Planner Newberg explained that there was a 13-page settlement agreement in 1982 with the former nursery that was on this site and the mobilehome park and a cross-complaint as to who was responsible for the actual seepage or drainage from property to property; and he advised that the agreement was to address the problem with plugging holes in the bottom of the wall on the west side, which has been done. Associate Planner Newberg added that this agreement has been passed on to this applicant; and he advised that there currently is no drainage problem. He added that the new storm mitigation design has addressed all the drainage so it properly drains to the storm drains and detention drains.

Mr. Gremillion explained that the detention basin and bio swells which have been incorporated into this project will naturally treat 100 percent of the storm drainage coming off the back of this building; advised that it has a filtration system integrated in the capturing system, with a pipe that will then discharge into the storm water system; and confirmed that this has all been taken into consideration with the site plan design.

Antonio Coco, civil engineer hired by Mr. Karkofi, stated that he has reviewed the traffic study and found a couple of things he disagrees with; with regard to Exhibit 10A, page 25 of the traffic study shows what has to happen in order for a tractor trailer to access this site; explained that tractor trailers normally need a 65-foot turning radius; that this exhibit shows in order to get into the northernmost driveway, the truck has to swing to the left and occupy all three lanes on Avalon Boulevard to make that right turn into the driveway; addressed his concern that this tractor trailer will have to wait until all 3 lanes on Avalon Boulevard are free/empty to make this maneuver; and that a tractor trailer will have to wait and stand at a distance from that driveway further down the road in order to be ready to swing out into the 3 lanes in order to get into the applicant's driveway. He pointed out that this exhibit shows this tractor trailer must be parked right in front of his client's driveway to do this; he addressed his concern these trucks will routinely be blocking his client's driveway and will impede traffic to and from his client's business; and he expressed his belief most of the trucks will use the driveway entrance on Avalon Boulevard. He reiterated his concern with the stacking/queuing of trucks entering this site and blocking his client's business operations. He suggested the applicant consider alternative ways of access, such as using the Gardena Boulevard driveway, which would still allow them to use a counterclockwise circulation pattern.

Vice-Chairman Gordon asked if the truck movement of swinging into the street is considered abnormal.

Mr. Coco stated no, but reiterated that the waiting to make this movement has the potential to block his client's driveway, which is only 90 feet away from the applicant's driveway.

Vice-Chairman Gordon pointed out there are a lot of businesses in Carson which have trucks entering their sites similar to what is being proposed by this applicant.

Mr. Coco stated that the status quo would be fine if there were not that many trucks visiting this site, but he pointed out there potentially will be 20 trucks visiting this site every hour.

Vice-Chairman Gordon stated a maximum of 9 trucks is being proposed during peak times.

Mr. Coco noted his disagreement with the applicant's proposed distribution, believing the ratio of trucks will be one every 5 to 6 minutes.

Associate Planner Newberg stated that staff used the property information system, which measured from five feet south of the north property line to the southernmost area of the driveway of the carwash to be approximately 100 feet; and explained that the applicant widened the driveway in order for the trucks to more easily make that turn on the northbound side of the proposed driveway. He added that the city's traffic engineer saw no issue with the traffic study and proposal.

Mr. Coco reiterated that the tractor trailers must occupy 3 lanes in order to turn perpendicularly into that driveway; and that those trucks have to stand at least 60 to 80 feet back on Avalon Boulevard to make that move into the driveway.

Vice-Chairman Gordon pointed out that Mr. Coco agrees this maneuver is no different than what is routinely done throughout the day in Carson at other sites that receive truck traffic.

Mr. Coco said the difference is these tractor trailers will be blocking his client's driveway while waiting to be able to make the turn into the applicant's driveway.

City Attorney Wynder asked if the applicant is proposing any solution.

Mr. Coco stated that the applicant's driveway could be moved south so that the trucks standing/waiting to get into the site don't occupy or block his client's driveway; or as a second alternative, have all the trucks come in from Gardena Boulevard, noting they can still use their counterclockwise circulation.

Mr. Gremillion advised that they did meet with the adjacent property owner, Mr. Karkofi, to discuss this project; that Mr. Karkofi noted his peak hours for business are typically after 10:00 A.M. and before 4:00 P.M.; advised that his peak hours of operation for truck access are going to be before 9:00 A.M. and after 4:00 P.M.; and that they both understood at that meeting their businesses would be on opposite times for peak business operations.

Mr. Hursh, applicant's traffic engineer, commented on the two alternatives suggested by Mr. Coco; explained that having all the access come in from Gardena Boulevard does

not work because they wouldn't be able to maintain the counterclockwise flow because the building is not situated to allow for that; secondly, reversing the flow to have clockwise flow with all the access at the southernmost driveway and northern driveway could exacerbate the problems that Mr. Coco identified with traffic blocking. He explained that the driveway has been widened so the trucks don't have to slow down that much; and that there is a clear approach/throat with no obstructions, no parking, no counter flow, all one inbound direction, so the trucks will be moving as they come into the site. He explained that if they make that an exit only driveway, the trucks will be starting from a dead start onto Avalon Boulevard; that the trucks will probably swing wide and do so at a slower rate and then potentially block traffic; and he stated that this was discussed with Associate Planner Newberg and Traffic Engineer Garland, both who agreed the applicant's proposal is the preferred access for this site.

Associate Planner Newberg pointed out that Condition No. 79 ensures that additional 'No Stopping at Any Time' signs will be erected on the southbound side of Avalon Boulevard, north of the property.

Simon Karkofi, co-owner of Equinox Carwash next door, stated that he would like to see development on the neighboring site, but expressed his concern with how their trucking operations will negatively impact his business if these trucks block his only entrance to his business. He stated the applicant's driveway is only 95 feet away from their driveway and noted that most tractor trailers measure 70 to 80 feet long; and he stated he has invested a lot of money into his business and reiterated his concern with the negative impact of blocking his entrance. He suggested the applicant's driveway on Avalon Boulevard be an exit only; and he asked that a condition be added to control dust during grading/construction.

Commissioner Diaz asked if the applicant's understanding of his peak hours was correct.

Mr. Karkofi indicated that his peak hours for business runs all day, from 7:00 A.M. until it gets dark. He expressed his concern that 90 percent of the trucks utilizing this site will be using this driveway on Avalon Boulevard.

Vice-Chairman Gordon asked the applicant what are his peak hours of operation.

Mr. Karkofi stated that early morning they have their peak hours, then into the afternoon, from 7:00 A.M. up to 6:00 P.M. or 7:00 P.M. when it's light outside.

Vice-Chairman Gordon asked if he is saying it's continuous peak hours.

Mr. Karkofi stated he has more business in the afternoon.

There being no further input, Chairman Faletogo closed the public hearing.

Planning Commission Decision:

Commissioner Diaz moved, seconded by Commissioner Saenz, to concur with staff recommendation, thus adopting Resolution No. 12-2422. Motion carried, 6-0 (absent Commissioners Brimmer, Faletogo, Williams).

12. NEW BUSINESS DISCUSSION	None
13. WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS	None
14. MANAGER'S REPORT	

- Carson Street Improvement Project, car wash, and Olive Garden

Senior Planner Signo advised that City Council/RDA approved the above- mentioned items that were recommended by the Planning Commission for approval. He added that because of the elimination of redevelopment funding, the Carson Street Improvement Project will not take place unless other funding becomes available.

Senior Planner Signo invited the Planning Commissioners to attend the February 24, 2012, South Bay Cities Council of Governments 13th Annual General Assembly at the Carson Community Center: Be Prepared, Preventing Disasters/Planning for Recovery. He noted the meeting starts at 9:00 A.M. and ends at 2:00 P.M.

Senior Planner Signo advised that the City will be providing an ethics training (AB 1234) workshop for staff on Wednesday, January 25, 2012, from 4:00 P.M. to 6:00 P.M. in City Council Chambers; and encouraged the attendance of those Planning Commissioners who have yet to take this workshop which is required every two years. He added that if they cannot attend, the training is also available on the internet and that Recording Secretary Bothe can provide the link to that site.

15. COMMISSIONERS' REPORTS

Commissioner Saenz asked about the status of the vacant lot adjacent to the Sanitation District.

Staff advised that they have no current status report to provide and that they will seek updated information and report back if there is anything new to report.

Commissioner Schaefer advised that she attended the ribbon cutting ceremony at Reflection Park on Shearer Avenue on Saturday, noting the small park is a wonderful addition to that area.

16. ADJOURNMENT

At 8:20 P.M. the meeting was formally adjourned to Tuesday, February 14, 2012, 6:30 P.M., City Council Chambers.

Chairman

Attest By:

Secretary