



TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 28, 2017
701 East Carson Street, Carson, CA 90745
Helen Kawagoe Council Chambers, 2nd Floor
6:30 p.m.

**MINUTES
REGULAR MEETING OF THE
PLANNING COMMISSION**

Members:

De Shon Andrews	Chair Louie Diaz	Uli Fe'esago
Sharon Guidry	Vice-Chair Ray Madrigal	Michael Mitoma
Ramona Pimentel	Barbara Post	Charles Thomas

Alternates:

Jane Osuna	Christopher Palmer	Myla Rahman
------------	--------------------	-------------

Staff:

Planning Manager Naaseh	Assistant City Attorney Gerli	Senior Planner Rojas
----------------------------	----------------------------------	----------------------

"In accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990, if you require a disability related modification or accommodation to attend or participate in this meeting, including auxiliary aids or services, please call the Planning Department at 310-952-1761 at least 48 hours prior to the meeting." (Government Code Section 54954.2)

I. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Diaz called the meeting to order at 6:34 p.m.

II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Commissioner Mitoma led the Salute to the Flag.

III. ROLL CALL

Planning Commissioners Present: *Andrews, Diaz, Fe'esago, *Guidry, *Madrigal, Mitoma, Pimentel, Post, Thomas *(Andrews and Guidry arrived soon after roll call)

Planning Commissioners Absent: *Madrigal departed the meeting at 7:35 p.m.

Planning Commission Alternates Present: Osuna, Palmer

Planning Staff Present: Planning Manager Naaseh, Assistant City Attorney Gerli, Senior Planner Rojas, Associate Planner Alexander, Contract Planner Edwards, Recording Secretary Bothe

IV. ORAL COMMUNICATION FOR MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA

The public may at this time address the members of the Planning Commission on any matters within the jurisdiction of the Planning Commission. No action may be taken on non-agendized items except as authorized by law. Speakers are

requested to limit their comments to no more than three minutes each, speaking once. No comments

V. NEW BUSINESS

A) Selection of Chair/Vice-Chair

Louie Diaz was selected as the Chair, and Ramona Pimentel was selected as the Vice-Chair.

VI. CONSENT CALENDAR

A) Minutes: January 24, 2017

Without objection, the January 24, 2017, Planning Commission Minutes were approved as presented (Andrews and Guidry had not yet arrived).

VII. PUBLIC HEARING

A) Design Overlay Review No. 1622-16, Conditional Use Permit No. 1008-16, General Plan Amendment No. 99-16, Zone Change No. 176-16

Applicant's Request:

The applicant, Kathleen Calvert for Meta Housing Corporation, is requesting the approval for a 46-unit affordable "artist lofts" residential development located at 21205 S. Main Street.

Staff Report and Recommendation:

Associate Planner Alexander presented staff report and the recommendation to APPROVE the proposed project subject to the conditions of approval attached as Exhibit "B" to the Resolution; and ADOPT Resolution No. 17-2598, entitled, "A Resolution of the Planning Commission of the city of Carson approving Design Overlay Review No. 1622-16 and Conditional Use Permit No. 1008-16, and recommend to the City Council to consider approval of General Plan Amendment No. 99-16, and Zone Change No. 176-16 for a 46-unit affordable 'artist lofts' residential development for a property located at 21205 Main Street in the RM-25-D zoning district."

Commissioner Mitoma, echoed by Commissioner Thomas, noted his concern with the limited amount of enclosed private storage space.

Associate Planner Alexander explained that the applicant requested the deviation from this requirement so that there would be an adequate landscape buffer between the two properties and also to provide an appropriate number of onsite parking spaces, having taken into consideration the concerns from the existing residents in the adjacent neighborhood; added that there is internal storage within each unit; and pointed out that this was one of the requirements staff believed could be eliminated while remaining compatible with the adjacent residential area. She mentioned that community rooms

are also being provided, noting there are various work spaces throughout the site for the apartment residents.

Planning Manager Naaseh explained that storage space is required by city code, but because this is an affordable housing development, state law allows deviations from that code.

Commissioner Guidry stated she has the same concerns with the small areas and asked where these artists are going to work since they are not permitted by code to conduct business outside; and she noted her concern with the reduction of parking and the likely need for a shared parking conditional use permit (CUP) for large events that may take place at this site, highlighting the intensity of noise from those events and the impacts to the neighbors.

Associate Planner Alexander explained that because of the likelihood of future events taking place at this site, staff is suggesting that prior to having some sort of event on site, a shared parking CUP should be obtained.

Commissioner Guidry commented on the upcoming citywide General Plan Update (GPU) process, questioning if this parcel can appropriately accommodate a high-density development; and questioned whether the GPU should be completed before this project is considered.

Planning Manager Naaseh mentioned that staff just interviewed consultants for this approximate 2-year General Plan Update process; he stated that staff believes this is an appropriate project for this site; that it is compatible with the surrounding neighborhoods; that staff believes the zone change is appropriate at this time; and he added that the proposed use provides a good buffer between the two uses, the existing industrial uses to the north and the existing single-family uses to the south.

Commissioner Post stated she has the same concerns with the reduction in parking spaces and size, no onsite guest parking, reduced size of patios, balconies and private storage space.

Associate Planner Alexander noted that state code allows affordable housing developments a reduction in parking spaces/size; stated that the parking spaces being provided can accommodate some onsite visitor parking; but added that staff is suggesting a shared parking CUP be obtained prior to a large event, possibly with the industrial development to the north of this project.

Senior Planner Rojas explained that California is challenged with the high demand for affordable housing developments in a state with very high land, construction, and building costs; advised that one of the biggest cost factors to consider when building a development is the high cost of providing parking spaces; and that the state has allowed a reduction of the required number of parking spaces if these affordable developments are close to a transit station, believing that lower income residents would not be able to afford one or more vehicles. He added that 46 parking spaces is a substantial number taking into consideration this is an affordable housing development; advised that this reduction in parking would not be permitted with a market rate development; and stated

that with rising housing costs and minimal land, cities are going to have to find ways to get maximum use with minimal space.

Commissioner Post asked what kind of contamination is on this site.

Associate Planner Alexander explained that through the Phase I environmental studies, onsite soil contamination was identified which requires removal and replacement and final approval by the Fire Department to assure cleanup is done properly.

Commissioner Post asked for further information on the remediation efforts on this site.

Associate Planner Alexander deferred that request to the applicant.

Senior Planner Rojas addressed Commissioner Thomas' inquiry regarding affordable housing and the close proximity to transit services; highlighted the various transit pick-up/drop-off spots near this site, noting these transit sites have been identified by the Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG) Regional Planning Act as those which meet the criteria outlined in AB 744 (Planning and Zoning: Density Bonuses). He added that SCAG has identified this area as a high quality transit corridor which provides the frequency of service that enables it to meet this requirement; and pointed out that SCAG follows strict criteria they apply to the entire region to identify these areas as meeting these fairly high thresholds for what most would consider good transit service.

Commissioner Thomas noted his concern with the limited balcony, outdoor storage, workspace, and limited bike parking areas.

Commissioner Mitoma stated there should be a remediation expert signing off on this project.

Planning Manager Naaseh explained that the County Building and Safety Department, which issues grading permits for Carson, reviews the grading improvements and that they have experts who are charged with reviewing the soils reports and are familiar with remediation activities.

Senior Planner Rojas added that the Regional Water Quality Control Board reviews and analyzes the contaminants and places very strict requirements upon applicants before they can move forward with grading; and that the City defers to that agency all of the soil remediation issues because they have a thorough and stringent process, with much higher standards than in the past. He advised that the Regional Quality Water Control Board has to inspect the site in order for the applicant to pull a grading permit.

Commissioner Guidry stated that she does not see anything in the conditions which requires a shared parking CUP for an onsite event that exceeds a certain number of people attending.

Commissioner Thomas asked to see an overlay of this City's transit hubs, expressing his belief that AB 744 would qualify every project being within a half-mile of a major bus route.

Chairman Diaz opened the public hearing.

Chris Maffris, Meta Housing representative, explained that these units are not designed to be live/work units, that they are typical, affordable live units, formal apartments for professional artists; advised that they are providing 5,000 square feet of common shared work space, where these artists can work outside of their units; noted that they are providing a sound-proofed music room; advised that this concept is something they've successfully done at six other developments; and mentioned that City Council members have toured some of their existing developments to see how they operate. With regard to storage, he mentioned that they have added 760 square feet of storage space in some or most of those areas and that they will consider adding more space if possible; and explained that the storage space is going to be divided up for shared purposes. He added that they will be providing one parking space for every 1-bedroom unit and two parking spaces for every 2- and 3-bedroom units, which is in line with state requirements for affordable units; and stated that this parking ratio has been sufficient in their other artist-related affordable developments. Mr. Maffris advised that they have done extensive soil testing at this site, two tests with over 30 borings; and that the contaminated soil will be handled through the soil management plan during the grading process and will need to be certified clean by the County Fire Department, which is the regulatory agency that approves soil remediation. He pointed out that the last thing they want are liability issues involving future tenants. He added that they also work with other public agencies on these projects and that there is incredible oversight on environmentally sensitive projects.

Commissioner Thomas asked if the number of bike spaces can be increased.

Mr. Maffris stated they will increase the number of bike spaces, but stated he does not know how many until he is able to speak with the architect.

Mr. Maffris noted for Commissioner Thomas that they are trying to limit balconies facing the single-family homes on the south side of the project; noted there will be additional balcony space areas on the bottom floor; and he added that the community workspace for the residents is larger than what is typically provided with other developments.

Commissioner Thomas asked if a resident has to be an artist to live in this development.

Mr. Maffris explained that this project has been regulated to maintain just that tenant mix; that because most artists don't make a living off their crafts, they must be gainfully employed to live in this development; but stated that if there were no artists applying, it would fall into a normal affordable apartment unit(s).

Vice-Chair Pimentel asked if students in art school with part-time jobs would be eligible to apply.

Mr. Maffris stated it depends on the amount of their income, but noted that unemployed students would typically not be eligible for affordable housing; and he noted that the artists' crafts can be in any classification.

(Commissioner Madrigal departed the meeting at 7:35 p.m. Alternate Commissioner Osuna was seated.)

Associate Planner Alexander stated that the applicant is seeking to delete Condition No. 77: "The Developer shall install separate sewer laterals to individually serve each building in the development. Installation and dedication of main line sewers may be necessary to meet this requirement"; and explained that because this is only one lot, this condition can be deleted.

Associate Planner Alexander stated it is staff's suggestion that a shared parking CUP be obtained prior to any special event that would exceed 50 people in attendance.

Commissioner Guidry questioned whether this project meets this density bonus under AB 744.

Senior Planner Rojas stated that Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG) transit corridor map has designated the two major transit service routes at Carson/Main Streets, both providing services to various locations and at the level of frequency that is required to qualify for the parking reduction as outlined by the state; and noted that SCAG is the agency which puts together the regional transportation plans as well as population provisions and a variety of other data and policy direction that municipalities follow. He highlighted the areas in blue as those being designated as high quality transit, noting they are limited to the southwestern portion of Carson. He pointed out that this reduction only applies to affordable housing developments. He mentioned that as far as staff can see, these two projects being considered this evening are the last two that will be proposed for a long while; and that with the last of the City's Housing Authority money, unless the City gets a large infusion of funds in the future, the City is not going to see another affordable housing development for the foreseeable future.

Mr. Maffris expressed his belief he might be able to add another 200 square feet of storage space, increasing those community storage areas to 960 square feet. He stated he is in concurrence with the conditions of approval, including the request to add additional bike spaces.

Commissioner Mitoma asked if more balcony space can be added.

Mr. Maffris stated that a few more can be provided, but that will have to be the architect's call; and he thanked staff for their hard work on this project, stating the project design has improved with their input.

Chris Palmer, resident, asked how long the affordability requirement is tied to the covenant, what concessions are tied to state law for affordability, and questioned whether there is adequate emergency access to the west side.

Associate Planner Alexander stated the 100-percent affordability requirement is tied to a minimum 55-year covenant; that a DDA is being developed between the applicant and the Housing Authority; and that the concessions are the size and number of parking stalls, the private patios and balconies, and the number of units. She explained that storage is now being taken off the table because various community storage areas are being provided; and that the affordability ranges from very low income to low income

thresholds. She advised that the Fire Department did review/approve the rear access; and added that the open space requirements have been met with this project.

Cathy Graveno, neighbor next to this project, stated that she lives just one house away from this project; advised that her neighbors are looking forward to the completion of this project; stated that their main concern is with there being adequate parking on site so as not to impose on the limited parking within their neighborhood; and urged the City to require a shared parking CUP, hoping the parking on the industrial property to the north can be used as overflow instead of using their severely limited parking in their neighborhood. She highlighted her concerns with traffic safety and the street median in front of the project, advising that motorists are illegally turning into the industrial site from that median, cutting into this property instead of going up and coming back around to safely/legally enter into that center.

There being no further input, Chairman Diaz closed the public hearing.

Planning Commission Decision:

Chairman Diaz moved, seconded by Commissioner Fe'esago, to approve the applicant's request with the following amendments: delete Condition No. 77, ~~The Developer shall install separate sewer laterals to individually serve each building in the development. Installation and dedication of main line sewers may be necessary to meet this requirement~~"; additional bike parking stalls shall be added to the plans prior to the issuance of building permits; storage spaces shall be increased to 960 square feet prior to the issuance of building permits; any event held at the property hosting more than 50 people shall require obtaining a shared parking conditional use permit prior to the event; that this event requirement be added to the tenants' agreements; individual outdoor spaces are not to be used for work areas; and moved to adopt Resolution No. 17-2598. Motion carried, 9-0 (Madrigal departed the meeting at 7:35 p.m., calling up Alternate Osuna).

VII. PUBLIC HEARING

**B) Design Overlay Review No. 1632-16 and
Conditional Use Permit No. 1018-16**

Applicant's Request:

The applicant, Thomas Safran & Associates, is requesting to construct a four-story mixed-use project consisting of 51 affordable residential units, and 2,500 square feet of commercial uses within the MU-CS (Mixed-Use – Carson Street) zoning district for the property located at 600 W. Carson Street.

Staff's Report and Recommendation:

Contract Planner Edwards presented staff report and the recommendation to APPROVE Design Overlay Review No. 1632-16 and Conditional Use Permit No. 1018-16 subject to the conditions of approval attached as Exhibit "B" to the Resolution; and

ADOPT Resolution No. 17-2599, entitled, "A Resolution of the Planning Commission of the city of Carson approving Design Overlay Review No. 1632-16 and Conditional Use Permit No. 1018-16 for development of a four-story mixed-use project consisting of 51 affordable residential units and 2,500 square feet of commercial uses within the MU-CS (Mixed-Use – Carson Street) zoning district located at 600 W. Carson Street."

Commissioner Mitoma asked if the south elevation balconies overlook the existing, single-story residential area.

Contract Planner Edwards explained that there is a generous buffer of 30 feet from those areas.

Commissioner Thomas asked if the west elevation patios overlook the 110 Freeway.

Contract Planner Edwards indicated yes, however, he noted there is a corridor that extends, with the units being recessed beyond that corridor.

Chairman Diaz opened the public hearing.

Tyler Monroe, representing Thomas Saffron, stated that this company has been working in Carson since 2008, helping to revitalize Carson Street with its newer development across the street from City Hall and with this proposed project; advised that the six patios are substantially set back 30 feet from the property line, which exceeds code by quite a bit; pointed out that Thomas Saffron is well known for its landscaping, noting that there will be substantial landscaping on this site; and that the four stories has been stepped down to three nearest the residential area to minimize the impact.

Chairman Diaz asked if the applicant agrees with the conditions of approval.

Mr. Monroe noted his concurrence with the conditions of approval.

Chris Palmer, resident, asked for clarification on the affordability of this project.

Contract Planner Edwards clarified that 25 units will be placed under the covenant; however, 50 will be restricted to affordability.

There being no further input, Chairman Diaz closed the public hearing.

Planning Commission Decision:

Commissioner Mitoma moved, seconded by Commissioner Guidry, to approve the applicant's request, thus adopting Resolution No. 17-2599. Motion carried, 9-0 (Madrigal departed the meeting at 7:35 p.m., calling up Alternate Osuna).

VII. PUBLIC HEARING

C) Conditional Use Permit No. 1006-16, Design Overlay Review No. 1627-16, Zone Text Amendment No. 27-16, and Variance No. 561-16, Zone Change Case No. 177-17

Applicant's Request:

The applicant, Goodyear Tire & Rubber Company, is requesting to construct a new blimp hangar, maintenance building and related site improvements at the existing Goodyear Blimp Port in the SU-BP-D-ORL (Special Use; Blimp Port; Design Review; Organic Refuse Landfill) zone for the property located at 19200 South Main Street, APN 7339-017-002.

Staff Report and Recommendation:

Continue to March 14, 2017.

Chairman Diaz opened the public hearing.

Planning Commission Decision:

Without objection, this item was continued to the March 14, 2017, Planning Commission meeting. (Madrigal departed the meeting at 7:35 p.m., calling up Alternate Osuna).

VII. PUBLIC HEARING

D) Design Overlay Review No. 1631-16

Applicant's Request:

The applicant, Chas Fisher of Cypress Equities, is requesting to permit the remodel of the existing Sears building within the SouthBay Pavilion Mall by demising the existing floor area into four retail spaces, updating the exterior façade, and minor landscape improvements, located in the CR-MUR-D (Commercial, Regional Mixed Use Residential – Design Overlay) zoning district located at 20700 S. Avalon Boulevard.

Staff Report and Recommendation:

Continue to March 14, 2017

Planning Manager Naaseh advised that Sears is shrinking its footprint and bringing in new tenants to their building; and noted that staff is pleased with their design proposal, but stated that staff is recommending this item be continued to March 14th to allow additional time to negotiate a suggested transit center.

Chairman Diaz opened the public hearing.

Planning Commission Decision: Without objection, this item was continued to the March 14, 2017, Planning Commission meeting. (Madrigal departed the meeting at 7:35 p.m., calling up Alternate Osuna).

VIII. MANAGER'S REPORT

Senior Planner Rojas distributed to the Commission the 2016 Annual Planning Report, highlighting the progress, accomplishments, and awards of the Planning Department, Planning Staff and the Planning Commission.

The Commission commended and thanked staff for showcasing all the accomplishments of the Planning Department and the Planning Commission this past year.

Planning Manager Naaseh commented on the following:

- advised that the Economic Development Commission (EDC) has voiced its concern with the proposed Development Impact fees (DIF) and requested information regarding this issue; stated that one of EDC's concerns is the unknown amount of the fees; and explained that staff will continue to work with its consultant on the DIF issues, noting they have yet to put in place an interim fee. He advised that the current applicants now in the planning process have been informed of this DIF; and that the applications now indicate a DIF condition will be imposed on projects going forward, noting that staff will continue to report on the progress of this undertaking.
- Addressed the upcoming General Plan Update undertaking, noting that he will be seeking the Planning Commission's input into this process and would like to have participation/input from every community in this City, noting that he will be seeking the Commission's input on the best way to reach out to get involvement from every sector in this community.
- Advised that Kia has been given written/verbal notice to remove within 7 days the cars illegally parked on the dirt lot at the end of Recreation Road and another lot in the City, advising that the owner has been advised he has five days to remove those vehicles from those sites.
- Advised that Mayor Robles appealed the Planning Commission's approval of the continued/existing auction operations and other related uses on the former Kott site at the corner of Avalon and 213th Street; and that the Planning Commission's decision was ultimately overturned by the City Council. He noted that the auction business has cleaned up the landscaping/perimeter of the property; and that staff has been informed the property owner is ready to come in within the next 30 days with preliminary plans for this property.

IX. COMMISSIONERS' ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

Commissioner Mitoma welcomed new Alternate Commissioner Osuna and Contract Planner Edwards.

Commissioner Thomas commended staff on the projects brought forth this evening.

Alternate Commissioner Osuna thanked everyone for the warm welcome, noting she is looking forward to working with this Commission.

Commissioner Fe'esago thanked and commended staff for the 2016 Annual Planning Report, noting his enjoyment in being part of this Commission; and asked that those Commissioners who were not present at this evening's awards ceremony be provided an All American City pen.

Commissioner Guidry welcomed new Alternate Commissioner Osuna and Contract Planner Edwards; congratulated staff on the recognitions they have received from this industry throughout last year, stating she is proud of those professional accolades; and she thanked Planning Manager Naaseh for looking into the illegal parking of Kia's vehicles on the dirt patch at the end of Recreation Road. She thanked Commissioner Post for nominating her as Vice-Chair of this Commission, but explained that she believes she needs a little more experience/familiarity with the meeting protocols before accepting that position; and stated she likely would be ready for that task at the next Chair/Vice-Chair nomination process.


Vice-Chair Pimentel thanked those who voted for her this evening; and she asked staff to contact Public Works regarding a downed tree at Alameda/223rd Street.

Chairman Diaz thanked the Commission for their confidence, voting him in again as the Commission's Chair, expressing his confidence in the members' wisdom to make these difficult decisions; he congratulated Vice-Chair Pimentel on her new role on this body; and he welcomed Alternate Commissioners Osuna, Rahman and returning Alternate Commissioner Palmer; and welcomed Contract Planner Edwards. He thanked and commended staff for providing the informative 2016 Annual Planning Report, noting his delight with the Planning Department's achievements within this City and their professional accolades. He invited everyone to attend his HOA's hosting of two workshops at the Dominguez Community Center, 21156 S. Santa Fe Avenue, a workshop to address protecting the residents from the Zika virus. He stated that there will be two workshops tomorrow: one from 8:30 a.m. to 9:30 a.m. and one from 7:30 p.m. to 8:30 p.m.

X. ADJOURNMENT

At 8:56 p.m., the meeting was formally adjourned to Tuesday, March 14, 2017, 6:30 p.m., Helen Kawagoe Council Chambers.


Chairman

Attest By:

Secretary

