



TUESDAY, April 27, 2021
701 East Carson Street, Carson, CA 90745
6:30 p.m., Via Zoom

MINUTES

MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION

Members: Chair: Charles Thomas Vice Chair: Chris Palmer Louie Diaz
Carlos Guerra Del Huff Jaime Montecarlo
Karimu Rashad Dianne Thomas Vacant
Alternates: Vacant Vacant Vacant
Staff: Planning Manager: Betancourt Assistant City Attorney: Jones

"In accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990, if you require a disability related modification or accommodation to attend or participate in this meeting, including auxiliary aids or services, please call the Planning Department at 310-952-1761 at least 48 hours prior to the meeting." (Government Code Section 54954.2)

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson Thomas called the meeting to order at 6:42 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: C. Thomas, Palmer, Diaz, Huff, Guerra, D. Thomas

Absent: Rashad *(Entered meeting at 6:53 pm)

Montecarlo (Excused Absence)

Alternates: None

Planning Staff: Betancourt, Jones

3. ORAL COMMUNICATION FOR MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA

The public may at this time address the members of the Planning Commission on any matters within the jurisdiction of the Planning Commission. No action may be taken on non-agendized items except as authorized by law. Speakers are requested to limit their comments to no more than three minutes each, speaking once. *(see below) None.

***DUE TO CORONA VIRUS COVID-19, NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WILL BE ALLOWED INTO CITY HALL DURING THE PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING. THE MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED VIA REMOTE TELECONFERENCING USING THE ELECTRONIC "ZOOM" APPLICATION.**

Any members of the public wishing to provide public comment for the items on the agenda may do so as follows:

1. Live via Zoom Application. Members of the public wishing to provide public comment in real-time will be invited to join the Zoom meeting remotely to provide their public comment live with their audio/video presented to the Planning Commission. Members of the public wishing to do so must email planning@carson.ca.us, providing their real name and the phone number they

will use to call in from, no later than 3:00 p.m. on the date of the meeting. For further details/requirements and meeting invite information, please email planning@carson.ca.us no later than 3:00 p.m. on the date of the hearing.

2. Email: You can email comments to Planning@carson.ca.us no later than 3:00 p.m. before the meeting. Please identify the Agenda item you wish to address in your comments. Your comments will be read into the record.

3. Telephone: You can record your comments at (310) 952-1720 no later than 3:00 p.m. before the meeting. Please identify the Agenda item you wish to address in your comments. Your comments will be read into the record.

4. Box outside of City Hall: You can provide hand-written comments by dropping off a note at the box located in front of City Hall (701 East Carson Street) no later than 3:00 p.m., on the date of the meeting. Please identify the Agenda item you wish to address in your comments. Your comments will be read into the record.

NOTE: Members of the public wishing to observe the meeting live without providing public comment will be able to do so by watching it on the City's PEG television channel (Channel 35 on Charter or Channel 99 on AT&T for Carson residents) or via live streaming on the City's website, <http://ci.carson.ca.us/>).

4. CONSENT CALENDAR/CLOSED SESSION

CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL – ANTICIPATED LITIGATION

A closed session will be held pursuant to Government Code Section 54956.9 (d)(2) or (d)(3) and (e)(1) because there is significant exposure to litigation in one potential case.

Assistant City Attorney Jones stated no reportable action was taken.

A) Minutes Approval: April 13, 2021

Commissioner D. Thomas (1st) Motion to approve, Commissioner Huff 2nd; Motion passed unanimously.

B) Modification No. 2 to DOR 1621-16 & Conditional Use Permit 992-15

Chair Thomas explained that the applicant is asking for more time to take care of an Eagle that is using the tower as a nest.

Commissioner D. Thomas (1st) Motion to approve, Commissioner Huff 2nd; Motion passed unanimously.

5. NEW BUSINESS

A) Conditional Use Permit 1106-20/DOR 1842-20

Commissioner D. Thomas (1st) Motion to approve, Commissioner Diaz 2nd; Motion passed unanimously.

B) Relocation Impact Report No. 04-19

Staff Alexander gave a presentation about RIR 04-19.

Chair Thomas opened the public comment.

Letters from the following were depicted on the screen as public record: Carlos Franco, Joshio Jauregui, Thomas W Casparian, Paula and Angel Goyco and Debora N Fore.

Afterwards the applicant's representative, Tom W Casparian, spoke about the property and answered questions from the public and the commissioners.

Each member from the public was able to leave a comment and speak upon the RIR No. 04-19 for 3 minutes.

Maria's Ipad- from Space 80 Mendoza family: Directed a question at Tom W Casparian; Since they don't want to provide a fair share to buy us out why don't doesn't the ownership sell the 30 plus homes the own and distribute that to the owners of the mobile homes?

Thomas Loveto- Many tenants moved in to have affordable housing. He purchased his home in 2005 when the market was expensive. With a lot of effort and sacrifice he purchased his home at top dollar considering the supply and demand. He would like a fair resolution so that he can live with dignity in a place that is affordable.

Dina- After reviewing the RIR, she believes that the comparable rents from the mobile homes and the ones in neighboring cities prove that it is currently not affordable to live with the new rental pricing everywhere. Seeing as it is low income demographic in the mobile homes, Dina believes that it will leave to a lot of displacement. She said it is hard for those who live pay check to pay check and support their families.

Jesus Space 69- He is a single father of three children. He stated that affordable housing is not attainable currently. He wants them to consider truly what is affordable housing.

Omar Rodriguez- Currently a tenant since 2006. His concern is that no one notified them about the park closure. He said that the park stated that they were going to get an extension of 35 years. He wants to know how long will the park closure will take. He also wants clarity from the owners about his contract.

Staff McKina Alexander asked to display Debora Fore appraisal on the screen. Chair Thomas permitted it and commissioners reviewed.

Rancho Dominguez Resident (Name not given)- She wants to know how long the process is going to take. She asked, is there a place they can stay until they find another home. She also wanted another appraisal for their homes.

Samuel Figueroa- He stated that they are offering a small appraisal and that they paid a lot initially for this home. He said that new mobile homes are currently \$150,000-\$200,000. He stated that housing is currently very expensive. He states that they need time to make changes. He said because of the pandemic a lot have lost their jobs. He asked to please take that into consideration.

Space 181- Stated that they paid off their home with their savings. She would like fair pay for their home as well as a better evaluation.

Rancho Dominguez Resident: (Name not given) Addressed Chair Thomas, she stated that she just came out of the hospital from a heart attack. She stated that she is low income and cannot afford to pay rent anywhere else. She said seven families arrived to live at the park newly rented. She said why you would close the parks. She asked the commissioners to please speak in the residents favor. She said that she is 68 and continues to work to pay to live in the City of Carson. She said that she only receives \$700 in pension currently. She said they

couldn't rent. Only to sell their homes to the Spencer's since 2012. She is asking for a fair evaluation.

Maria (Park resident): My daughter is 12 and goes to school in Carson. She states that she is very sick and her husband is the only one working. She is asking for a fair evaluation.

Jan Smith: She wants answers to the questions that were given this evening. She wants to know what will happen. She said that she worked hard on the letter that was presented this evening to the commissioners. She said that she needs guidance.

Chair Thomas proceeded to explain the process to Jan Smith.

Attorney Jones explained the process under the city's code.

Public Comments Commenced:

Mr. West, Space 17: Resident for 6 years. He would like to stay. He said that he is looking for mercy with the City of Carson. He said that he is 5 minutes away from his job. He said with the pandemic this is not a good timing. He said that he is looking for a fair evaluation. He said that is hard for his family as well as the residents.

William Koons: He said that he is not in favor of this park closure or any future closures. He said that as the owner stated that he was having problems with his zoning. He said that he does not believe that the owner wanted to truly keep the mobile home park. Koons said that he does not approve the appraisals that were given to the park residents. He suggests that the applicant looks at different options.

Eduardo Anthony Alameda Junior, Space 79- He asked for help in this situation. He said that this park has a lot of elderly. He asked to listen from the heart to guide them in the right path. He asked how long he has until the park is closed.

Bertha Alaraza, Space 13: In 2019 she stated that the owner was attempting to buy mobile homes. Bertha received notice shortly after that the mobile homes were closing. She wants to know why that came to be.

Jose Gonzalez, Space 64: He wants a fair appraisal for the home. He said that he still owes money on his space. So he wants a justified fair appraisal.

Angelica Rodriguez: She would like help due to the pandemic. She said that she has a daughter that cannot live in areas that are too hot. She said because of her medical needs she cannot pick up and leave. She said that two years ago she asked Donna Spencer if they are going to close. She stated that Donna said that everything is going to be fine. She said she placed a sign to sell on her home after she found out the applicant did not place an extension to stay. Then the manager told her that she could not do it. The owner originally offered her \$30,000 for her home. Afterwards now with the pandemic they are offering her \$9000 for her home. She said this is causing a lot of stress to the residents. She said she would like a fair appraisal

Staff Betancourt explains the next portion of the process. Then discussion ensued with commissioners, staff and attorneys.

Commissioner Thomas thanked the public commenters and thanked everyone for displaying their thoughts and concerns. She then mentioned the seven families that moved in knowing that they are closing the park and her concerns on that matter.

Tom W Casparian: Stated that no new space is being sold or rented. The park owners own 24 of the homes that are rented on a month to month basis. These families are in understanding of the park closure.

Commissioner Thomas had an additional statement and question: The applicants in 2009 and 2012 were assured by the Spencer's and by managers of the park that they would be receiving an extension from the city and not worry about anything. What can you comment about that?

Tom W Casparian: Stated, People interrupted what they wanted to. He stated that people were given written notice about the closure. He said that in 2009 and 2012 the park owners wanted an extension; they met with the City Attorney, planning director and housing manager to seek an extension of the variance and were told clearly that was not going to happen.

Chair Thomas asked if there are any other questions for Tom W Casparian.

Chair Thomas: Asked if the applicant is prepared to give an additional moratorium of closure beyond the six months included in the statue due to pandemic.

Tom W Casparian: Stated the staff report made clear the city was only going to give one year to act on a closure approval. If the city granted more time he said it was more likely that the mobile home will not close in that period of time. However he said because the staff report states one year, the ending results depend on what the planning commission and city council ultimately decide.

Commissioner Thomas: Asked when Tom W Casparian has received this case and worked on it.

Tom W Casparian: Stated, Over 10 years.

Chair Thomas and Tom W Casparian discussed code enforcements involvement.

Commissioner Huff: Asked about the letter sent to the residents. Applicant stated that it was provided on the presentation. She asked if they would like to know that the residents receive a copy of the letter sent to the ownership groups about the closure.

Commissioner Guerra: Asked a question to Tom W Casparian. Did the city take any enforcement action to close the mobile park. Tom W Casparian stated with speaking to the city attorney and being told no on certain terms he interrupted that as enforcement action.

Commissioner Thomas: Stated that the city had a moratorium on the closing, is there any attempt made to have an extension at that time.

Tom W Casparian: He has no communication during that time during pertaining to the moratorium.

Commissioner Diaz: He has concerns that with the 81 residents and renters that they deserve a fair assessment of their investments.

Tom W Casparian: He stated that we are here to speak about the residents not the renters. He stated that the staff report recommends that the home owners be payed the current fair market value of their homes. The appraiser was hired by the city not the park owners. They came up with those figures. He said that he will not address this issue tonight but touch on the history.

Chair Thomas: Addressed this question to Tom W Casparian, Do you believe that the amount that you are proposing for the 81 residents are comparable to any in California?

Tom W Casparian: He mentioned Bel Abbey park closure 2008. He said that he is proposing the same methodology.

Chair Thomas: Asked, Do you think that the offers are fair?

Tom W Casparian: Stated, Yes.

Additional Public Comments permitted by Chair Thomas:

Wife of Daniel Herrera: Asked, Attorney Jones stated that the evaluations were at fair market price. She stated that they did the appraisal without going into the house.

Rocio: Is concerned about the pricing that is appraised of their home as well as her sister's home.

Marias IPad: Stated his parents have been here since 1998. He stated his friend is staying on a lease not a month to month basis.

Samuel Space 3: Stated his neighbor space 4 rented it currently for one year. Not a month to month basis. They never let anyone sell their home. He is concerned that they will pay every homeowner a low evaluation and then rent them for more than \$2000 to new home owners.

Chair Thomas and applicant discussed the RIR further.

Chair Thomas thanked everyone and closed the public hearing.

City Attorney Soltani stated that the history of communications between Casperian's office and previous attorneys are irrelevant to the facts. The facts are the facts. That the park owner has filed for a park closure application and the city has not mandated it. This is a park initiated park closure. The city gave the park owner an opportunity for a responsible zone change. The second issue is that no inspection was done inside the park homes. However with conditions of approval it states if you have proof of upgrades such as receipt of upgrades that those will be taken into consideration similar to Imperial Avalon. The in home inspection was not given because of the pandemic. The condition suggested will help to rectify that. Sunny also stated that at the expense of the park owner that the conditions be translated for those who speak Spanish. The last issue is that the extension of time. She gave a recommendation condition saying that the park closure cannot happen any earlier then January 27, 2022 from the date of park closure they have one year after this said date.

Chair Thomas: He does not believe the appraisals are fair. So he proposes the following: First, He would like to see the higher appraised value or any proof of sale defined by escrow or receipts. Secondly, He would like the elderly 62 or older to receive instead of \$1000 he recommends \$5000. With the timing of payments as follows: Half is paid out 60 days prior to vacancy and the remainder upon vacancy. The last term is one year rental assistance for all residents in the park, renter or owners.

Commissioner Thomas: Agrees with the assessment from Chair Thomas with minor change to make it an onsite quote.

Chair Thomas: Would like to mandate that the park closure does not occur no earlier than one year a year from today and then an additional year to complete closure. He would also like that the conditional of approval is translated into Spanish and provided to all of the residents.

Commissioner Thomas: After reviewing page 17 item B7 she would like a submittal written request in Spanish and English added so that the residents have a form as a written notice that is available when they are ready to vacate to provide a location that they want to leave to.

Commissioner Diaz- Urges the applicant to move forward with remediation associated with their stated plans for moving to workforce housing for this site.

Chair Thomas makes a motion to approve the RIR with the following modifications: Owners will be given the higher of the appraised value or any proof of sale based upon escrow or receipts. Secondly as it relates to the timing of the closure, no closure of this park shall occur before

April 2022 and after April 2022. The applicant will have one year to complete the closure. The closure period or will be between April 2022-2023. Third, the elderly people age 62 or greater, will not receive \$1000 but \$5000 to eligible owners as one per unit provided that one or more of the household is elderly. Timing of these payments will be as follows, half will be paid out 60 days prior to vacancy and the remainder upon vacancy. Fourth the conditions of approval will be translated, also a simply form will be translated for request of relocation specialist assistance pursuant to 9128.21 E5 all owners and renters will receive rental assistance as defined by that statue. He also urges and recommends that the applicant immediately start remediation for their proposed workforce housing future plans.

Commissioner Thomas wanted to add to the first item the higher assessment value be onsite as opposed to offsite.

Commissioner Diaz asked that we go off the recommendation of Attorney Soltani, that we have the applicant pay for the translation of documents as discussed as it relates to the conditions.

Attorney Ben suggested clarification. Onsite evaluation is already added on the resolution. He also recommended that the date of park closure should be one year from the effective date of the cities action then should be closed in one year period after.

Commissioner Diaz, closed the debate.

Roll call commenced for approval for resolution with modifications.

Commissioner Diaz (1st) Motion to approve, Commissioner D. Thomas 2nd; Motion passed unanimously, 6-0 vote.

7. MANAGER'S REPORT

The Planning Manager had no comment.

8. COMMISSIONERS ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

Commissioner Huff stated that it was a large task but glad we were able to get it done. She thanked he chair, legal staff and everyone.

Commissioner Thomas has complimented the staff. She also brought a situation to light about Del Amo and Tajuata. She said that there are basketball courts that being built on developments on this street. He stated that it is unsafe to get out on Del Amo and Tajuata, many blind spots. She stated that she brought it up at a city council meeting and would like this to be addressed for the public. She thanked staff and congratulated Planning secretary Sandoval on her new position. Also thanked planner Alexander for her presentation. Planning Manager Betancourt stated that he will look into with Code Enforcement.

Commissioner Guerra said goodnight to everyone. Great meeting this evening. Thanked staff and commissioners.

Commissioner Diaz dittoed the remarks of the other commissioners. He commended the Chair on getting us to the resolution. He followed up with Staff Betancourt about the nuisance on Dominguez and Sante Fe St. He stated they are still racing and doing donuts on this street. Staff Betancourt stated he will follow up.

Vice Chair Palmer stated he had no comment

Chair Thomas stated that he said that this was a very impactful decision made today and not easy by any account. He wanted to make it a fairer deal for the tenants. He said that he is proud of the commissioners for helping.

9. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 11:59pm.

Chairman

Attest By:

Secretary