



TUESDAY, JULY 12, 2022
701 East Carson Street, Carson, CA 90745
6:30 p.m., Via Zoom

**MINUTES OF
THE
PLANNING
COMMISSION**

Members:	Vice Chair: Chris Palmer	Louie Diaz	Frederick Docdocil
	Carlos Guerra	Del Huff	Jaime Monteclaro
	Dianne Thomas	Karimu Rashad	Richard Hernandez
Alternates:	(Vacant)	DeQuita Mfume	Leticia Wilson
Staff:	Planning Manager:	Betancourt	
	Planning Secretary:	Vacant	
	Assistant City Attorney:	Jones	

“In accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990, if you require a disability related modification or accommodation to attend or participate in this meeting, including auxiliary aids or services, please call the Planning Department at 310-952-1761 at least 48 hours prior to the meeting.” (Government Code Section 54954.2)

1. CALL TO ORDER

Vice Chair Palmer called the meeting to order at 6:34 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Palmer, Diaz, Docdocil, Guerra (6:37pm), Huff, Thomas, Hernandez
Absent: Monteclaro (EA), Rashad (A), Wilson (A)
Alternate: Mfume
Planning Staff: Betancourt, Jones, Saied, Gonzalez

3. ORAL COMMUNICATION FOR MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA

The public may at this time address the members of the Planning Commission on any matters within the jurisdiction of the Planning Commission. No action may be taken on non-agendized items except as authorized by law. Speakers are requested to limit their comments to no more than three minutes each, speaking once. *(see below)

DUE TO CORONA VIRUS COVID-19, NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WILL BE ALLOWED INTO CITY HALL DURING THE PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING. THE MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED VIA REMOTE TELECONFERENCING USING THE ELECTRONIC “ZOOM” APPLICATION. TO FACILTATE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION, HOWEVER, THIS MEETING WILL BE AVAILABLE ONLINE VIA ZOOM ON THE FOLLOWING LINK:

Join Zoom Meeting:

Meeting ID: 845 2525 5858

ITEM NO. 5A

Passcode: 516138

Dial by your location: +1 669 900 6833 US

Any members of the public wishing to provide public comment for the items on the agenda may do so as follows:

1. Live via Zoom Application. Members of the public wishing to provide public comment in real-time will be invited to join the Zoom meeting remotely to provide their public comment live with their audio/video presented to the Planning Commission. Members of the public wishing to do so must email planning@carson.ca.us, providing their real name and the phone number they will use to call in from. For further details/requirements and meeting invite information, please email planning@carson.ca.us.

2. Email: You can email comments to Planning@carson.ca.us. Please identify the Agenda item you wish to address in your comments. Your comments will be read into the record.

3. Telephone: You can record your comments at (310) 952-1761 before the meeting. Please identify the Agenda item you wish to address in your comments. Your comments will be read into the record.

4. Box outside of City Hall: You can provide hand-written comments by dropping off a note at the box located in front of City Hall (701 East Carson Street) on the date of the meeting. Please identify the Agenda item you wish to address in your comments. Your comments will be read into the record.

NOTE: Members of the public wishing to observe the meeting live without providing public comment will be able to do so by watching it on the City's PEG television channel (Channel 35 on Charter or Channel 99 on AT&T for Carson residents) or via live streaming on the City's website, <http://ci.carson.ca.us/>.

4. CONSENT CALENDAR

A) Minutes Approval: April 26 and June 14, 2022

Commissioner Thomas 1st Motion to approve April 26, 2022 minutes, Del Huff 2nd; Motion passes with correction from Commissioner Diaz 7-1 (Mfume Abstain), (Correct Alameda & Tajauta to Alameda & Santa Fe for Commissioner Diaz Oral Communication on 04/26 minutes)

Commissioner Thomas 1st Motion to approve June 14, 2022 minutes, Commissioner Diaz 2nd; Motion passes 7-1 (Palmer Abstain)

5. PUBLIC HEARING

A) Mural Installation

Applicant's request:

Carmen Ponce, General Council - Trophy VPC, LLC, opposed staff's recommendation to modify Murals. Actual location for the Murals is 21126 S. Avalon Blvd. which it's on the application. Trophy will not take down the Mural or modifying it.

Naseer Watar, leased the property in 2018 and spent over 150 million to purchase the dealership.

They have invested and supported the City of Carson community by cleaning up Don Kott property, they cleaned up the landscape per City's request and are assisting in hiring and training to get students into the job market. The mural is a mural that will be nationwide. This is not a used car lot this is a used car strategy for the group. Fab is similar to Carvana, mobile app to buy & sell cars thru mobile app. Fab is one in 3 companies that have that capability. It will be difficult to take FAB logo out of the Mural. They did not add the man falling on wall. This appeared after putting up the Mural. Banksy (a famous graffiti artist) might had done this art according to some experts. FAB will stay at that location until they break ground on the development. That may happen in the next four to five years.

Speakers:

Katie Pandolfo, General Manager for Dignity Health Sports Park. Home of the LA Galaxy. Proud member of this community for about 20 years. She was part of the committee that helped develop the Carson Street Master Plan beautification project. It was transformative what it has done to that street. Public Art is very important for the visual aspect when coming into the City. She urges to approve this project in its current state.

Barry Waite, President & CEO of the Carson Chamber of Commerce. He worked 29 years with the City of Carson as well as several years as a City Planner. What we are discussing now the ordinance was not intended for this. Painted signs on side of building were a common problem back then. The subject Mural is not a nuisance and it's very positive, it's tasteful and vibrant. It's something that should be encouraged. They are good member of the community. The mural is beautiful and he was surprised there was an objection to it. Hope the commissioners interpret the ordinance as it was meant to be and hope they approve the murals as they are.

Edie Trott, Sr. Director, Marketing, NewMark Merrill Companies, Inc. Thanked Alvie for inviting her and to the rest of the commission for hearing her input. NewMark purchased a portion of South Bay Pavilion. In 2020 she was put in charge of community art program and they have installed 22 murals. The community response in each of those area have been positive from Sacramento to San Diego all the way to Chicago. They select local artist to show case their murals. She is not here to interpret the signage in question but to advocate for the art itself. Some communities don't have the opportunity to get to museums. If a business or shopping center can utilize their walls, it's almost a duty to do that. Let the mural stand as is.

Commission discussion:

Commissioner Thomas shared a presentation. Took pictures of murals at different cities. Art is subjective, what you may like someone may not like. Murals associated with graffiti. You see the art, but you also see the graffiti and tagging on the murals. That's a problem to her. She loves art. We want to make sure that what we are doing will enhance the city. What message are we trying to convey? Tagging spreads beyond murals. Where do you find this? You find it in urban areas, in many cases it's lower income areas, it's in areas with high population of color. There's some city's that you don't see this. Carson Street has sculptures, that does not invite tagging. We just approved the 157-acre high end shopping center at the opposite side of the freeway and what we are hoping to attract with that, murals and tagging are not going to do it. You can put your mural in the inside. We don't want to create an atmosphere that invites tagging. Tagging goes beyond the art. We don't want that for Carson. We want to attract business like yours because it's going to be beautiful and it's going to be clean. Urging fellow commissioners to not approve this mural. Make all changes and look at our ordinances for this.

Commissioner Guerra concurs with Commissioner Diane Thomas' assessment. Not only does it encourage graffiti but also gang activity from his experience. He's leaning towards what Commissioner Thomas conveyed.

City Attorney Jones – Public hearing is closed. Voting is on approval of the mural and not on any changes to policy or to amending the code.

Commissioner Hernandez, first thing that got him was the application for approval for something that's already up there. He went by there and the 2nd Mural looks like graffiti to him. He understands that it's private property but he doesn't think it reflect the business esthetic look. If we allow this, it will set a precedence.

Commissioner Palmer. All murals come to Planning Commission. The mural is already there before they received permission. Painted wall signs are not allowed per municipal code. The painted signed is the issue. Can we have a mural? Is there a compromise? We are business friendly. To make it a mural you must remove the advertisement of the business. You can cover it up by an affixed sign that it's not part of the mural. No painted wall signs. The flowers and the colors are not considered signage and are consider a mural. He has an issue with the applicant because they don't have the intention to remove it. The code is what the code says. No painted wall signs. Code says graffiti has to be removed within 72 hours. The Fab logo is signage and it is painted.

Staff Report and Recommendation:

Planning Manager Betancourt presented staff report, presentation, and the recommendation to Adopt Resolution 22-xxxx, entitled, "A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF CARSON CONDITIONALLY APPROVING TWO MURALS LOCATED AT 21140 S. AVALON BLVD. WITH THE REMOVAL OF THE FAB LOGO.

Planning Commission Decision:

Vice Chair Palmer 1st Motion, Commissioner Diaz 2nd; Commission did not accept staff's recommendation, to approve the Mural subject to conditions of approval. Vote 3-5. Motion failed.

Subsequent motion, to open Public Hearing, vote to continue item to next meeting for close session and no noticing required.

Commissioner Thomas 1st Motion, Commissioner Hernandez 2nd; Planning Commission 8-0. To continue item to next Planning Commission meeting. (Vote on subsequent motion).

6. PLANNING MANAGER'S REPORT

Nothing to report.

7. COMMISSIONERS' ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

Commissioner Thomas thanked City Staff, Assistant City Attorney Jones, and Commissioners for allowing presentation.

Commissioner Diaz had questions progress report on 1055 Sandhill Avenue. Where are we in permit process for this project? Alvie will talk to Diaz offline and gave update on applicant on needing clearance for grading and documents needed to be forwarded to consultant. Diaz mentioned resident's property – neighbor removed fence, left her property exposed and neighbor encroached her property line. Alvie ask for Commissioner Diaz to email information and offer to talk to him offline to discuss this.

Commissioner Huff expressed that it's wonderful to work together and acknowledged the work of Graffiti Committee. It cost a lot of money to remove graffiti. Grateful for commissioner Thomas for taking the time to gather all the information. Thanked everyone. Have a wonderful 2 weeks.

Alternate Mfume thanked the Commissioners and City staff and to Commissioner Thomas for

doing her due diligence.

Commissioner Docdocil thanked City staff and fellow Commissioners.

Commissioner Hernandez said Lucille Sandoval moved to different department and wanted to say that she did a great job. She's going to be missed. He asked about Gas station on 223rd St & Main. Asked if the city has Solar Program. Asked about water conservation programs for the city, he retired from the Water Department and would like to know how he can help. Alvie said Gas Station (223rd & Main) has been abandoned for some time and if he hears of anything for this location, he will let him know. Alvie will follow up with Public Works to ask about subsidized Solar Panels Partners. Alvie will follow up on funds for changing grass to sod.

Commissioner Guerra thanked Alvie for Power Edison complain, they are finally taking their complain seriously to remove fence. He requested CCTV camera/surveillance face and license plate recognition cameras. We need to make a safer Carson.

Vice Chair Palmer thanked everyone. Asked if the Commissioners will receive a formal invite for City's 55th Anniversary Celebration.

8. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 8:00 p.m.

For further information: 310-952-1761

Agendas and Reports: http://ci.carson.ca.us/communitydevelopment/planning_agenda.aspx

This Planning Commission is subject to the Ralph M. Brown Act. Among other things, the Brown Act requires that the Commission agenda be posted at least 72 hours in advance of each meeting and that the public be allowed to comment on agenda items before the Commission and items not on the Commission agenda but are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission. The Commission may limit public comments to a reasonable amount of time, generally three (3) minutes per person.