

# **TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 21, 2022**

701 East Carson Street, Carson, CA 90745 6:30 p.m., Via Zoom

# **MINUTES**

# MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION

Members: Vice Chair: Chris Palmer Louie Diaz Frederick Docdocil

Carlos Guerra Del Huff Jaime Monteclaro

Dianne Thomas Karimu Rashad Richard Hernandez

Alternates: (VACANT) DeQuita Mfume Leticia Wilson

Staff: Planning Manager: (Vacant)

Planning Secretary: Gonzalez

Assistant City Attorney: Jones

"In accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990, if you require a disability related modification or accommodation to attend or participate in this meeting, including auxiliary aids or services, please call the Planning Department at 310-952-1761 at least 48 hours prior to the meeting." (Government Code Section 54954.2)

#### 1. CALL TO ORDER

Vice Chair Palmer called the meeting to order at 6:31 p.m.

#### 2. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Palmer, Diaz, Docdocil, Guerra, Huff, Thomas, Rashad, Mfume,

Wilson

Absent: Monteclaro (A), Hernandez (EA)

Planning Staff: Naaseh, Jones, Guisar, Gonzalez, Rubio

#### ORAL COMMUNICATION FOR NON-PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

The public may at this time address the members of the Planning Commission on any non-public hearing items on the agenda. Separate public comment periods will be provided for public hearing items during the respective hearings. Speakers are requested to limit their comments to no more than three minutes each, speaking once. \*(see below)

None

### 3. ORAL COMMUNICATION FOR MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA

The public may at this time address the members of the Planning Commission on any non-agendized items within the jurisdiction of the Planning Commission. No action may be taken on non-agendized items except as authorized by law. Speakers are requested to limit their comments to no more than three minutes each, speaking once. \*(see below)

None

DUE TO CORONA VIRUS COVID-19, NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WILL BE ALLOWED INTO CITY HALL DURING THE PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING. THE MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED VIA REMOTE TELECONFERENCING USING THE ELECTRONIC "ZOOM" APPLICATION. TO FACILITATE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION, HOWEVER, ACCESS TO THIS MEETING WILL BE AVAILABLE TELEPHONICALLY USING FOLLOWING CALLIN INFORMATION:

Join Zoom Meeting:

Meeting ID: 845 2525 5858

Passcode: 516138

Dial by your location: +1 669 900 6833 US

Any members of the public wishing to provide public comment for this meeting may do so as follows:

- 1. Live via Zoom Application. Members of the public wishing to provide public comment in real-time may join the Zoom meeting remotely via telephone to provide their public comment live during the applicable public comment period with their audio presented to the Planning Commission. Members of the public wishing to do so are requested to email <a href="mailto:planning@carsonca.gov">planning@carsonca.gov</a> in advance, providing their real name and the phone number they will use to call in from. For further details or questions, please email <a href="mailto:planning@carsonca.gov">planning@carsonca.gov</a>.
- 2. Email: You can email comments to <a href="mailto:planning@carsonca.gov">planning@carsonca.gov</a> before the meeting. Please identify the Agenda item you wish to address in your comments. Your comments will be read into the record.
- 3. Telephone: You can record your comments at (310) 952-1761 before the meeting. Please identify the Agenda item you wish to address in your comments. Your comments will be read into the record.
- 4. Box outside of City Hall: You can provide hand-written comments by dropping off a note at the box located in front of City Hall (701 East Carson Street) on the date of the meeting before the meeting starts. Please identify the Agenda item you wish to address in your comments. Your comments will be read into the record.

NOTE: Members of the public wishing to observe the meeting live without providing public comment will be able to do so by watching it on the City's PEG television channel (Channel 35 on Charter or Channel 99 on AT&T for Carson residents) or via live streaming on the City's website, <a href="http://ci.carson.ca.us/">http://ci.carson.ca.us/</a>).

#### 4. CONSENT CALENDAR - None

#### 6. PUBLIC HEARING

**A.** Environmental Impact Report (SCH No. 2021010116), Specific Plan No. SP 21-19, General Plan Amendment No. 105-19, Development Agreement No. DA 23-19, Site Plan and Design Review No. DOR 1803-19, Vesting Tentative Tract Map No. TTM 83157, and Zone Change No. ZCC 118-19

**Applicant**: Imperial Avalon, LLC

21207 South Avalon Boulevard

Carson, CA 90745

Request: Request for approval of a mixed-use project including 1,115

residential dwelling units, 10,000 square feet of restaurant area, and 111,581 square feet of publicly accessible but privately maintained open space within the Imperial Avalon Specific Plan

Area.

**Property Involved:** 21207 S. Avalon Boulevard

APNs 7337-001-025; -026; -027; -028; and -029

Interim Manager Gena Guisar gave a presentation.

Commissioner Thomas – How will this project help to solidify the Housing Element of the General Plan to get our General Plan approved by the state?

Community Development Director Naaseh – The Housing Element requires the city to provide about 5,600 units in new housing in the City of Carson for the Housing Element cycle. The 5,600 units are a mix of income levels for each housing category. There is extremely low income, very low income, low income, and moderate income. Anything moderate and below is considered affordable housing and they have deed restrictions. Anything above is considered the market rate. This project falls above market category and satisfies a big chunk of the numbers. In addition, the development agreement requires this project to provide 125 affordable units. It can be an existing project or build a new project somewhere in Carson providing the same mixture of low-income housing. There are timelines associated and if they are not met, then they have affordable housing in-lieu fees of \$11.91 per square foot of residential area that they would have to pay.

Commissioner Thomas – The approval of this project would bring us closer to the numbers that we need to satisfy the state requirements of the city for the Housing Element of our General Plan.

Community Development Director Naaseh – Yes, this is a big project in Carson and it will go a long way towards meeting some of the requirements.

Acting Planning Secretary Gonzalez - Let the record reflect that Commissioner Wilson has joined the meeting.

Assistant City Attorney Jones – The Housing Element has received determination of substantial compliance with the State Housing. The Housing Element itself is not going to be subject to further changes.

Commissioner Guerra – The report indicates that there will be a traffic signal at 213<sup>th</sup> and Grace, will it include a left turn arrow south bound travel unto Grace Avenue?

Drew Heckathorn, Environmental Consultant – That type of detail would be contingent upon a full engineering study. The inclusion of a left arrow would be considered at the time of the engineering study. It has yet to be determined.

Commissioner Guerra – This is crucial, children and senior citizens walk in this vicinity. Is there an approximate distance from the Grace entrances to 213<sup>th</sup> and 215<sup>th</sup> street?

Community Development Director Saied – We are looking into it and we will provide the answers.

Commissioner Guerra – Can you provide clarity in regards to the actual size in stories?

Interim Manager Guisar - The specific plan allows up to six stories for apartments however, the site plan review package and the development agreement limit the height to four stories for the apartments.

Vice Chair Palmer opened the public hearing.

Barry Spradling – I live across the street and I'm very excited about this project. We had a very positive meeting with Darren Embry. This company is seriously talking to neighbors. Darren mentioned that they could bring the entrance down to Javelin Street where it's not in front of anybody's house and it would solve a big problem in that area with people that are dumping big things. Since we're having all this new traffic coming through, I would like to request a couple of speed bumps on Grace Avenue. We have people coming at various hours racing cars. It would also be good to put speed bumps along 213<sup>th</sup> Street, I see people running that stop sign every day.

Community Development Director Saied – I have the information related to the access point. The current proposed entry on Grace Avenue is about 650 feet North of 213<sup>th</sup> Street. Javelin Street is another 400 feet to the North of that.

Barbara Kennedy – In 1999 I purchased a beautiful and affordable mobilehome at the Avalon Imperial Mobile Estates. I paid off my mortgage and I thought I was ready to retire. In 2019 my world was shatter when I got the official letter of intent to close the park. Today I get unreliable promises which can not sustain the quality of my life.

Ray Aldridge – I am a resident and business owner in City of Carson. I am also the Chairperson of the Carson Economic Development Commission. I am speaking only as a resident and business owner. When I first heard about the closure of the park, I felt the same way Mrs. Kennedy did. I also realized that we have to have progress in the city. We know that Carson is under pressure to provide housing. I am in full support of the project as it stands, it suits pretty much everybody. We definitely need affordable housing.

Jeff Steiman – I'm being relocated temporarily until the park is completed. Using your timeline that date is now 2028. Where is the interim housing going to be? Why hasn't it been identified for those residents choosing to return to this project once it has been completed? We have been receiving listings that do not show affordable interim housing options in Carson and across the South Bay. To date the interim housing in Carson and the

surrounding areas in the South Bay have not been identified by any of the city's interim housing program managers nor either relocation specialists. Most of these residents are seniors and they don't know where they are going to go. Now you have extended our time in interim housing up to five years. I strongly urge you to review where the interim housing is and what the cost is before you proceed with this project. There is just no affordable, comfortable, promised future housing that is going to be available to us. Look at the numbers and make the calculations yourself as if you were the ones being moved into interim housing.

Applicant Darren Embry – The first units of this project will be available in December 2025. We have been issuing listings of a wide range of different product types to the HOA and their membership since October 2021. The HOA is currently advising its residents not to communicate with us. If the listings are not to Mr. Steiman or its memberships liking it would be great to understand how they are falling short, what the neighbors are looking for and then we could see how we can better help them identify this interim housing. There's a wide range of available units in the South Bay and beyond and we continue to invite the HOA to engage with us in that issue.

Applicant Darren Embry gave a presentation.

Jeff Steiman – Did all the residents that were removed go to interim housing and if they did where did they go?

Speaker – We are concern about air quality.

Ed Apodaca, General Manager of the Double Tree Hotel – This continued redevelopment benefit touches all of us, business included. We support this project to continue to grow Carson and our community where we live and work. We want to continue see it progress to its fullest potential.

Ron – Every single month I get a notice that says that there's housing available locally for me if I want to move. I have been here for twenty years, they are not offering fair market value for my home, and they want me to move. What am I going to do if there isn't interim housing available? I want to stay in the City of Carson and there's nothing available.

Garcia – If for any reason this development falls short the city is liable to take care of the residents of the Imperial Avalon Mobile Estates. I want to make sure that seniors are not forced out of their living places. They need your assistance and they need to be taken care of properly. They pay their fair share of taxes and they should get a proper placement if they are forced to relocate. The company that is buying them out needs to fully take care of them, and if they are not the city needs to pick up the difference because there is enough tax revenue to make sure that is done. You have this big development plan that is going to be generating millions of dollars. Make sure that everyone is one hundred percent satisfied with their offer.

Vice Chair Palmer – Staff please describe unbundle parking.

Interim Manager Gena – Residents aren't automatically getting a parking space. They will only get a parking spot if they choose to and it's separate from their rent.

Commissioner Rashad – Is the solar power only going to generate electricity for the parking electrical vehicles or is it going also going to supplement the restaurant and housing energy.

Applicant Darren Embry – It will be broad based and absolutely supplement the entirety of the project.

Commissioner Guerra – We had a resident speak in regard to speed bumps. It appears to have been ignored and to me it's very important. Are you taking it upon yourself to implement the speed bumps prior to building this project?

Applicant Darren Embry – Yes, I would ask our neighbors to cooperate with us, and the city to help us understand the process.

Community Development Director Saied – The request for speed bumps has to go through the city's process. The traffic engineer has to approve it and determine whether it is necessary or not. That is the review process the city has to go through before the speed bumps are installed.

Vice Chair Palmer closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Guerra – This is absolutely a wonderful project. We do have some safety concerns as mentioned during this process. This is going to generate more traffic and I have already received numerous complaints. We need to be more concern about the safety of our children, residents, and businesses.

Commissioner Thomas – I successfully had speed bumps installed in the streets around me. There is a process that you have to go through, and it has nothing to do with the builders. You have to present a petition to the engineer signed by all the residents impacted by the speed bump. Once it gets to the engineer and they come out and do their due diligence, they make sure that all the residents are in agreement. That process has to be undertaken by the residents and not by the builder.

Vice Chair Palmer (1<sup>st</sup>) Motion to approve, Commissioner Diaz 2<sup>nd</sup>; Motion passed unanimously 9-0

#### 7. PLANNING MANAGERS REPORT

Community Development Director Naaseh – All commissioner terms will expire on November 30<sup>th</sup>. You are encouraged to apply again if you are interested. It might take a while for the Council to appoint new commissioners. While that process is happening you remain commissioners until you are otherwise informed by the City Clerk's office that either you have been reappointed or that your term has not been renewed.

# 8. COMMISSIONERS' ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

Commissioner Diaz – Thank you to my fellow commissioners, excellent project.

Commissioner Docdocil – I would like to wish everybody a Happy Thanksgiving. The tree lighting ceremony is on December  $1^{st}$  and the Winter Wonder Land is on the  $10^{th}$ .

Commissioner Guerra – Thank you staff for the great work and diligence that you always do. Happy Thanksgiving to my fellow commissioners and staff.

Commissioner Huff – Happy Thanksgiving.

Commissioner Mfume – Vice Chair Palmer you have been great. Happy Thanksgiving everyone.

Commissioner Rashad – Thank you commissioners and staff for the excellent work. Happy Holidays.

Commissioner Thomas – I wish you all the best for the Thanksgiving Holiday.

Commissioner Wilson – Vice Chair Palmer you are doing an amazing job. Everyone Happy Thanksgiving.

Vice Chair Palmer – I couldn't do it without all of you. I appreciate everything that you bring. I look forward to seeing you in the future. Happy Thanksgiving.

#### 9. ADJOURMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 8:05 p.m.

For further information: 310-952-1761

Agendas and Reports: <a href="http://ci.carson.ca.us/communitydevelopment/planning-agenda.aspx">http://ci.carson.ca.us/communitydevelopment/planning-agenda.aspx</a>

This Planning Commission is subject to the Ralph M. Brown Act. Among other things, the Brown Act requires that the Commission agenda be posted at least 72 hours in advance of each meeting and that the public be allowed to comment on agenda items before the Commission and items not on the Commission agenda but are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission. The Commission may limit public comments to a reasonable amount of time, generally three (3) minutes per person.